

MINUTES OF 161ST (REGULAR) MEETING OF NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR HOMOEOPATHY HELD ON 19TH AND 20TH July 2023 AT SHELTON SUITES (BHURBAN) MURREE.

PROCEEDINGS: 1ST DAY

19TH JULY, 2023 (Wednesday)

The Following members attended the meeting:-

| S/No | Name | Designation |
|------|---|---------------------|
| 1. | Homoeopathic Doctor Rao Ghulam Murtaza | President |
| 2. | Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak | Vice President |
| 3. | Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan | Member |
| 4. | Homoeopathic Doctor Naeem Hafeez | Member |
| 5. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Irfan Wali | Member |
| 6. | Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux | Member |
| 7. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Aslam Khan | Member |
| 8. | Homoeopathic Doctor Mahmood ul Haq Abbasi | Member |
| 9. | Homoeopathic Doctor Tabassum Hussain | Member |
| 10. | Homoeopathic Doctor Waheed Ahmad | Member |
| 11. | Homoeopathic Doctor Siddique Ali Ansari | Member |
| 12. | Homoeopathic Doctor Raheel Muhammad | Member |
| 13. | Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem | Member |
| 14. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Idrees Tareen | Member |
| 15. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Moin Khan | Member |
| 16. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Asif Khan | Member |
| 17. | Homoeopathic Doctor Javed Akhter | Member |
| 18. | Homoeopathic Doctor Aisha Nawaz | Member |
| 19. | Dr. Shahzad Khurshid | D.S (Budget)/Member |
| | Mr. Aamir Nadeem Ramay | Secretary/Registrar |

- Homoeopathic Doctor Tariq Khan (Member NCH) did not attend the meeting due to his personal engagements. Homoeopathic Doctor Irum Naz Akhter did not attend the meeting due to sickness.

2. Meeting started at 10:00 a.m. Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan recited verses from the **"HOLY QURAN."** Homoeopathic Doctor Siddique Ali Ansari offered Na'at Sharif. Meeting chaired by the President Homoeopathic Doctor Rao Ghulam Murtaza. He welcomed all the members for their participation in the meeting.

OFFICE POINTS:-

Agenda Item No. 1: To confirm Minutes of 160th Regular Meeting of NCH held on 11th & 12th January, 2023 at Hotel Regent Plaza, Karachi.

The Chair put up the first agenda item before the House regarding confirmation of minutes of previous 160th Regular Meeting of NCH held on 11th & 12th January, 2023 at Hotel Regent Plaza, Karachi. The Secretary informed the House that two objections from

Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux were received regarding delay in issuance of minutes, the chair excused for delay in circulation of minutes and ensured the house that minutes will be circulated amongst the Members timely. The Secretary read out the second objection of Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux before the house as under:-

| Agenda Item No of previous Minutes | Objection raised by member | Discussion and Decision of the Council |
|--|---|--|
| On page 22 of the minutes (Table Motion) | On page 22 of the minutes, a Table Motion is attributed to an honorable member not presented during the meeting. It is important to note that while a table motion is initiated in the context of modification or alteration in the primary, subordinate legislature, or policy measures, it cannot be approved immediately. The reality is that this motion was not put forth. | i) Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem disagreed with the objection and insisted that it was discussed in the meeting. Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan seconded the stance of Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem. ii) Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux believed the correct procedure for proposing the amendments needed to be followed..iii) At this point, Homoeopathic Doctor Mahmood-ul-Haq Abbasi proposed that NCH would administer the eligibility test provided the age limit is removed. iv) In alignment with the views of Mahmood ul Haq Abbasi, Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux concurred that the qualifying examination should be labeled as a "fund raising" effort. He put forward a suggestion to establish a Fund raising Committee to bolster the Council's financial assets. Decision:- "After discussion, the house decided that the matter regarding fund raising on account of eligibility test referred to Act, Rules & Regulations Committee and the Committee will submit the report as early as possible. |

Homoeopathic Doctor Mahmood-ul-Haq Abbasi objected that some of his points were discussed in the previous meeting but not incorporated in the minutes. The Secretary informed that according to recording of minutes all the points which were put up and discussed by any Member

have been incorporated in the minutes accordingly. The Chair requested the Member concerned to pin point the issues which were not included in the minutes. The mover did not press further. Following the proceedings the Secretary put the minute of Budget Meeting held on 22-06-2023 for the approval.

"After above discussion, the house confirmed the minutes of 160th Regular Meeting of National Council for Homoeopathy held on 11th & 12th January, 2023 alongwith NCH Budget Meeting dated 22nd June, 2023.

Agenda Item No. 2: To Confirm Minutes of Selection Committee meeting held on 17th July, 2023.

The Secretary / Registrar put up a second item of agenda relating to the confirmation of minutes of the Selection Committee meeting held on 17th July 2023 before the house. He stated that advertisement regarding "SITUATION VACANT" was published in daily "Jang"(Combined Edition) on 7th June, 2023 for filling of vacant posts such as, one Assistant (Sindh U), one Assistant (Merit) and one LDC (Sindh U). He proceeded to provide the house with a summary of the available job positions and the recruitment process, as outlined below:

| SR. NO. | NAME OF POST | APPLICATION RECEIVED | SHORTLISTED CANDIDATES | NO. OF CANDIDATES APPEARED | NAME OF SELECTED CANDIDATE |
|---------|----------------------------|----------------------|------------------------|----------------------------|---|
| 1 | Assistant- BPS-15 (Merit) | 34 | 28 | 11 | Mr. Muhammad Hassan Usman S/o Muhammad Usman |
| 2 | Assistant BPS-15 (Sindh U) | 30 | 27 | 08 | Mr. Abdul Hameed S/o Muhammad Tariq |
| 3 | LDC-BPS-09 (Sindh U) | 26 | 22 | 07 | Mr. Arslan Ahmed Qureshi S/o Iftikhar Ahmed Qureshi |

Decision: *The House confirmed the minutes of Selection Committee meeting of NCH held on 17th July, 2023.*

Agenda Item No. 3: To confirm Minutes of Act, Rules & Regulations Committee meeting held on 18th July, 2023.

The Chair presented the next agenda item for discussion. Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux (Chairman of the Committee) proceeded to illustrate the minutes of the Act, Rules & Regulations Committee, providing a detailed explanation of the modifications made by the committee to Rule 9 (4), 12-A, and 13 (ix) of the UAH Rules from 1980, in comparison to the existing rules and suggestive modified text. Additionally, he voiced the concerns of the ARR Committee regarding the draft UNANI, AYURVEDIC, AND HOMOEOPATHIC - APPOINTMENT OF CHAIRPERSON AND MEMBERS OF EXAMINING BODY RULES, 2022. He conveyed the Committee's position to postpone it for further consideration, citing the need for additional discussions.

Homoeopathic Doctor Mahmood-ul-Haq Abbasi emphasized that the draft rules are integral to the Council's function. Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan seconded this perspective.

Decision:

The House confirmed the minutes of Act, Rules & Regulations Committee accordingly.

Agenda Item No. 4: To confirm minutes of Finance Committee meeting held on 18th July, 2023.

The Chair invited to Dr. Shahzad Khurshid, Deputy Secretary (Budget)/Chairman of the Finance Committee, to present the minutes of the Finance Committee meeting. The Chairman Finance Committee read out the minutes, which the Finance Committee has approved against various procurements tendered by NCH through quotations and their payments to be released to the vendors in due course after completion of the job, and approval is mandatory in light of Rule 11 (c) of NCH Administration, Financial & Management Rules, 2008. *"After discussion, the house confirmed the minutes of Finance Committee meeting held on 18th July, 2023."*

During the meeting, the Chair drew the attention of the house that Dr. Shafqat, Director of Health Services Academy, Islamabad is present here and desires to brief to the house regarding ultrasound course for the Homoeopathic Practitioners etc:-. He has been allowed to express accordingly. *The house appreciated the contents of the briefing and constituted a committee comprising:*

- i) Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-Ur-Rehman Khattak
- ii) Dr. Shahzad Khurshid Dy Secretary (Budget) CFC NCH
- iii) Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan
- iv) Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux

The house resolved that the committee will empowered to examine potential components, craft a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), and have its signed between NCH and Health Services Academy (HSA). The committee will also access the situation, if deemed necessary, include comprehensive courses to enable DHMS Diploma holders and BHMS Degree holding practitioners to make valuable contribution in critical scopes like diagnoses thorough trendy noninvasive techniques such as ultrasound and public health management. This will be done

alignment with established laws and pursuits. Subsequently, if required, the committee will provide recommendation after appropriately modifying the MOU, considering its contents and objectives. The Ministry of National Health Services, Regulations and Coordination will stay informed throughout this process. **Additionally, the house has further decided that president NCH will assist to the committee accordingly.**

Agenda Point No. 5 : To confirm minutes of inspection Committee meeting held on 18th July, 2023.

The Secretary put up the next agenda item before the house and read out the minutes of the inspection committee meeting held on 18th July, 2023 *which the house confirmed except for Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux who expressed dissent.*

The Secretary appended an additional inspection report for a specific committee formed to inspect the Baluchistan Homoeopathic Medical College in Quetta. This inspection was conducted in response to a decision dated: December 28, 2022 by the honorable Baluchistan High Court as documented in C.P No. 1816/2022. Furthermore, considering the findings in the inspection report and realizing it is the oldest Homoeopathic Medical College in the province, the house has allowed a 90 days grace period for rectifying the identified shortcomings. These deficiencies were pointed out and discussed with the college management during the inspection conducted on March 08, 2023. The house expressed satisfaction and agreed on. It was also decided that deficiencies should be re-checked by the inspection committee comprising of:-

- i. Dr. Shahzad Khurshid, Deputy Secretary (Budget)/ CFC NCH
- ii. Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux, Member NCH
- iii. Mr. Aamir Nadeem Ramay, Registrar NCH

The house has also instructed the office that if the stipulated period concludes without success, action may be taken based on the Council previous recommendations following the directives of the Honorable Baluchistan High Court in Quetta.

Agenda Item No. 6: To confirm minutes of the committee meeting held on 18th July, 2023 for award of title of professorship and others.

The Secretary read out the minutes of the committee meeting held on 18th July 2023 for the award of different titles of professorship and others, which were received in the NCH office vide 17 applications. He further briefed that the committee awarded the titles to the applicants by observing the laid down criteria as decided by the Council in its 157th Annual (Budget) meeting held on 17th to 19th June 2021.

After briefing of the Secretary, Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan requested the house that award may be titled directly on the basis of their length of service where the applicant will be entitled in the light of criteria as already decided by the Council.

Homoeopathic Doctor Naeem Hafeez and Homoeopathic Doctor Javed Akhtar disagreed with the proposal of Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan and suggested that title may be awarded on merit basis only.

After detailed discussion. The house reviewed/approved the following criteria for the award of different titles:-

| Titles | Length of Teaching Experience | |
|-----------------------|-------------------------------|---------------------------|
| | For Diploma Holders (DHMS) | For Degree Holders (BHMS) |
| Lecturer/Demonstrator | DHMS | BHMS |
| Senior Lecturer | 05 Years | 03 Years |
| Assistant Professor | 10 Years | 08 Years |
| Associate Professor | 15 Years | 13 Years |
| Professor | 20 Years | 18 Years |

The house resolved that titles already awarded by the Council shall not be withdrawn. The house did not agree with the recommendations of the Committee and directed that the committee may review the 17 application again in accordance with the criteria as mentioned above. The Committee will also empowered to examine, decide and approve all the cases which shall be received in NCH office for award of titles. The office is directed to issue letters regarding award category of title to the applicants which will be approved by the Committee.

Agenda Item No. 7: To discuss and approve the results of 07 M.B.B.S Doctors in the light of written test held in NCH office on 19th May, 2023 who have applied for DHMS Registration under section 24 (2) of UAH Practitioners Act, (II of 1965)

The Secretary presented next agenda item and informed the house that 07 applications were received from M.B.B.S Doctors who have applied for D.H.M.S Registration under section 24 (2) of UAH Practitioners Act, 1965. The written test was held in NCH office on 19th May, 2023 in the presence of the committee namely Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak and Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem. On completion of test, the committee checked the papers and following candidates qualified the exam as under:-

| S.NO | DOCTORS NAME | TOTAL MARKS | OBTAINED MARKS | REMARKS |
|------|--|-------------|----------------|---------|
| 1 | Dr. Qurat-ul-Ain D/o Ali Muhammad | 100 | 92 | Pass |
| 2 | Dr. Sania Saulat D/o Ali Muhammad | 100 | 92 | Pass |
| 3 | Dr. Asba Nisar Malik D/o Malik Nisar Ahmed | 100 | 92 | Pass |

| | | | | |
|---|---|-----|----|------|
| 4 | Dr. Muhammad Awais S/o Muhammad Tariq | 100 | 90 | Pass |
| 5 | Dr. Farwa Javed D/o Javed Salim | 100 | 92 | Pass |
| 6 | Dr. Muhammad Usama Anwar S/o Muhammad Anwar | 100 | 87 | Pass |
| 7 | Dr. Syeda Hadia Qamar D/o Syed Iqrar Hussain | 100 | 92 | Pass |

The Secretary further briefed to the house that prescribed fee of Rs. 12,100/- has already been deposited in Council Account by each individual.

Regarding this matter, Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux brought up an issue and mentioned that concerning the last two subpar incidents, he was entrusted with formulating the Terms of Reference (TOR) during our previous meeting. Subsequently, a draft of these TORs has been submitted accordingly, but the same cycle has occurred again, and essential test details of this testing process remain unavailable. Hence, it cannot be presumed to meet the expected standard.

Decision:

The House with the exception of Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux, who expressed dissent, approved the aforementioned results of the applicants and directed the Secretary for issuance of DHMS Registration accordingly under section 24 (2) of UAH Practitioners Act, 1965.

Agenda Item No. 8: To discuss the Ministry of NHSR&C letter No. F. 13-2/2017-E-1/NCH dated: 17th & 31st January, 2023 regarding draft appointment of Chairperson and members of Examining Body Rules, 2022.

The Secretary stated that above said agenda item was also included and part of Act, Rules & Regulations Committee. Hence, the Council has already discussed at agenda item No. 3 *and approved its minutes unanimously.*

Agenda Item No. 9: To discuss the application of newly established Khan Homoeopathic Medical College, Abbottabad under section 17 of UAH Practitioners Act, (II of 1965).

The Secretary put the next agenda item and informed the House that the application, along with relevant documents, has been received from Homoeopathic Doctor Sami Ullah, Principal Khan Homoeopathic Medical College, Abbottabad, for recognition of under section 17 of UAH Practitioners Act, 1965. The office checked all requisite documents/file and found correct. He further briefed that the college concerned has deposited a prescribed fee of Rs. 60,500/- vide Receipt No. 68518 dated 10-07-2023 as required under Rule 9 (1) of UAH System of Medicine Rules, 1980.

Decision:

The House approved the application of the newly established Khan HMC, Abbottabad, and constituted a committee comprising Deputy Secretary (Budget)/CFC NCH, Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan, and Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak to inspect the proposed building in light of Regulations for recognition of Homoeopathic teaching institutions, 1988,

Agenda Item No. 10 : To Discuss the presentation filed by Mr. Tariq Mahmood (Ex-Superintendent, NCH on grant of higher time scale (BPS-17) and payment of gratuity on retirement & executive allowance etc:-

The Secretary put up the next agenda item and briefed that Mr. Tariq Mahmood (Ex-Superintendent, NCH) retired from service on attaining the age of 60 years on 18th March 2023. The matter regarding the higher time scale of the incumbent was granted w.e.f 12-08-2018 by the time scale committee in its meeting held on 12th September 2022. When the payment file of back benefits was forwarded to the Chairman Finance Committee for concurrence, the Chairman Finance Committee objected that he was entitled to such promotion effective from the date of committee decision instead of the date of eligibility i.e. 12-08-2018. To re-examine the case in the light of contents of the relevant portion of the Finance Division, office memorandum bearing No. 1 (3) R-1/2010/2014 dated 10th September 2014 alongside revision issued from time to time, and laps indicated by the CFC, the meeting of Time Scale Committee was held on 07-03-2023 and the "Committee unanimously opined to correct the earlier decision and determined that the grant of time scale of Mr. Tariq Mahmood shall be deemed effective from the date of the approval of the committee (12th September, 2022). The Secretary informed the house that all the payable dues as admissible under the law have already been released in favor of Mr. Tariq Mahmood (Ex-Superintendent, NCH). The earlier was made due to an urgent need of money for the applicant daughter's marriage which requires the formal approval of the Council. The Council is to provide assent of the house accordingly. As regards, the matter for payment of gratuity on retirement & executive allowance the house resolved as under:-

- i) Payment of Gratuity on retirement: the NCH has framed the rules regarding scheme of Contributory Provident Funds called as CPF Rules, 1983 and the employees of NCH are being paid the said funds. It was observed in the light of 2001 PLC 1199 that gratuity is not applicable to those employee who are availing the benefits of CPF.
- ii) Grant of Executive Allowance: in terms of Finance Division O.M. .F.No.10(02) R/-3/2018-297 dated 19-07-2022 the Executive Allowance is admissible only to gazette Officers of (BPS-17 & above). The post of the Superintendent herein NCH does not fall under this category hence the request is declined.

Decision:

After a detailed discussion, the House observed that the demands of the applicant have no legal standing hence set a side.

Agenda Item No. 11 : To discuss the matter regarding issuance of DHMS Registration Certificate to Hafiz Abdul Rehman S/o Muhammad Bashir in light of findings of the Honorable Wafaqi Mohtasib in Complaint No. HQR/1757/14.

The Secretary briefed the House about the history of the case. He stated that Hafiz Abdul Rehman S/o Muhammad Bashir is matric in (General Group) and he was enrolled fraudulently on fake documents during the session 2003-04 with the manipulation of Principal, Khurshid Memorial HMC, Mandi Bahauddin. After qualifying the four years of DHMS, he applied for issuance of registration, but according to section 21 of the UAH Act, 1965, he was neither entitled for admission nor registration under section 24 (1) of the said Act.

He filed a **complaint No.HQR/0001757/14** before the Hon'able Wafaqi Mohtasib, Islamabad, on 12th March 2014, and findings from Wafaqi Mohtasib were received on 14-09-2014. On receipt of the conclusions, the NCH filed a review petition on 10-10-2014. Furthermore, the applicant filed an application in the Supreme Court of Pakistan (Human Rights Cell) on 10-12-2015. The Secretary further briefed that the Council has already decided and formulated the policy about the fate of the students during the 144th (Regular) meeting held on 30th & 31st December 2015 inclusively in similar cases. The office has already implemented the decision of the Council in true spirit. The said case is pending in the NCH office for implementation regarding the issuance of his registration, as several hearings were held in Wafaqi Mohtasib Secretariat in the captioned complaint. He briefed the house that the last hearing was held on 29-03-2023. The Registrar recorded the statement before the advisor that the Council (Consisting of 21 members) is a competent forum to decide/ review the matter about the issuance of his registration in accordance with the Rules and Regulations and the **next date is fixed for implementation on 25-07-2023.**

Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak stated that if NCH had already issued a registration certificate to any student with the same batch might also be issued.

Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Aslam Khan seconded the view point of Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak.

Decision:-

After detailed discussion and taking into consideration all aspects of the matter, the House withdrew the decision already taken by the Council in its 144th (Regular) meeting held on 30th & 31st December, 2015 and directed to the Secretary that a Registration Certificate may be issued to Hafiz Abdur Rehman S/o Muhammad Bashir.

Agenda Item No. 12: To Discuss the letter received from Deputy Secretary (Budget)/CFC NCH Ministry of NHR&C regarding admissibility of grant of executive allowance to BPS 17-22 officers of organizations outside Federal Secretariat.

The Secretary put up next agenda item and requested to Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux for briefing in the light of letter under reference because this point relates with Registrar, NCH. Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux stated that letter bearing No. Dy. 744/DSB from of the Chairman Finance Committee dated: 15th June, 2023. He further stated that Finance Division, OM No. 10(16)R-3/2022-201 dated: 12th June, 2023 provides guidance based on the specific case of the Human Organ Transplant Authority, Islamabad, under their particular rules and status. However, this guidance is not generalized as a policy order for other Autonomous Bodies. Furthermore, the grant of executive allowance also applies to the ICT field administration, which is not covered under Rule 2 (vii) and schedule-1 of the Rule of Business 1973. The National Council for Homoeopathy operates on similar principles as described in para 2 above, where all financial matter are reviewed and recommended by the Finance Committee and subsequently presented before 21 members of the Council. In this particular case, the Council reviewed the Finance Committee's recommendations in the light of Rule 3 (1) of the NCH Administration, Financial and Management Rules, 2008 taking in to account the precedent set by a large organization like CDA in their Notification No. CDA/FW(G)-44(28)(EA)/2022/17 dated: 17th August, 2022. It was also considered that no unique financial benefits granted by the Federal Government could be extended to him.

Based on the above, the grant of executive allowance to the Registrar is justified, as the competent forum of NCH has approved it.

The majority of the members agreed with the statement explained by Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux and once again strongly recommended for grant of executive allowance to the Registrar, NCH.

Dr. Shahzad Khurshid, CFC stated that Finance Division (Regulation Wing) has already clarified the admissibility of grant of executive allowance of the officers of Human Organ Transplant Authority (HOTA) vide letter dated: 12th June, 2023 and declared that officers of HOTA are not entitled for executive allowance. He further stated that the same clarification should be applicable in the instant case for executive allowance to the officer of NCH.

Decision:-

After detailed briefing and discussion, the house up hold the previous decision taken by the Council in its 159th Annual (Budget)/Resumed meeting held on 13th September, 2022

Agenda Item No. 13: To discuss the report regarding formulation of policy for registration of students who have passed BHMS Graded Degree Program for two years.

The chair presented the next agenda item and invited Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux to brief the house. He read the report submitted by the Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak (Vice President NCH) and Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem, Member NCH, regarding NCH letter No. F.5-1 (158th M/2022)-9425 dated 28th May, 2022. At this juncture, Homoeopathic Doctor Mahmood-ul-Haq Abbasi objected that the Two-Year syllabus was neither approved by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) nor by the National Council for Homoeopathy. Any university in Pakistan cannot affiliate any college for the Two-Year B.H.M.S degree unless the institution shall have separate building. Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak suggested that all Homoeopathic Medical Colleges can be allowed subject to the conditions for Two-Year BHMS Graded Degree program for upgrading the educational level of diploma holders, and he further stated that when the registration is issued and the qualification may assumed as added qualification beside D.H.M.S. Those persons if they registered as practitioner may be allowed to write the word B.H.M.S Graded within quotation on their professional profiles and this qualification will be assumed as per Section 39 (1) of UAH ACT, 1965.

The Secretary drew attention of the House towards discussion made on members points No. 3 submitted by Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem during the 149th (Regular) meeting held on 27th to 29th December, 2018 and the Council decided as under:-

"Issue a letter to concerned Homoeopathic Medical Colleges to stop 02 years BHMS Degree program immediately in the best interest of profession and to save the future of students".

Homoeopathic Doctor Naeem Hafeez suggested that the above decision may be withdrawn and restore the two years degree program for the boost up of profession.

Decision:-

After detailed discussion, the house decided that the previous decision of the 149th meeting of the Council is to be withdrawn and to allow a Two-Years graded degree program in addition to D.H.M.S. This will be improved the qualification level of diploma holders. The house also decided that the syllabus committee should frame a syllabus of BHMS graded degree program and have it sent to quarters concerned. However, Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux, recorded his dissent.

At 5:00 pm meeting is adjourned for next day.

PROCEEDINGS: 2nd DAY**20TH JULY, 2023 (Thursday)**

Following attended the meeting:-

| S/No | Name of Members | Designation |
|------|---|----------------------------------|
| 1. | Homoeopathic Doctor Rao Ghulam Murtaza | President |
| 2. | Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak | Vice President |
| 3. | Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan | Member |
| 4. | Homoeopathic Doctor Naeem Hafeez | Member |
| 5. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Irfan Wali | Member |
| 6. | Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux | Member |
| 7. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Aslam Khan | Member |
| 8. | Homoeopathic Doctor Mahmood ul Haq Abbasi | Member |
| 9. | Homoeopathic Doctor Tabassum Hussain | Member |
| 10. | Homoeopathic Doctor Waheed Ahmad | Member |
| 11. | Homoeopathic Doctor Siddique Ali Ansari | Member |
| 12. | Homoeopathic Doctor Raheel Muhammad | Member |
| 13. | Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem | Member |
| 14. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Idrees Tareen | Member |
| 15. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Moin Khan | Member |
| 16. | Homoeopathic Doctor Muhammad Asif Khan | Member |
| 17. | Homoeopathic Doctor Javed Akhter | Member |
| 18. | Homoeopathic Doctor Aisha Nawaz | Member |
| 19. | Dr. Shahzad Khurshid | Dy Secretary (Budget)/CFC NCH |
| | Mr. Aamir Nadeem Ramay | Secretary/Registrar |

2. Meeting started at 10:30 a.m. Homoeopathic Doctor Waheed Ahmed recited verses from the "HOLY QURAN." Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan offered Na'at Sharif. Meeting chaired by the President Homoeopathic Doctor Rao Ghulam Murtaza. He welcomed all the members for their participation in the meeting.

Agenda Item No. 14: To discuss the TOR-Evaluating the knowledge, registration under section 24 (20 of UAH Practitioners Act, (II of 1965).

The Chair introduced the next agenda item to be discussed and asked Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux to provide a briefing on it. He detailed the Terms of Reference (TOR) pertaining to section 24 (2) of the UAH Practitioners Act (II of 1965). This section, within the UAH Practitioners Act of 1965, enables Medical Practitioners to seek registration as Homoeopaths by demonstrating their proficiency in Homoeopathy. As a result, evaluating

practical experience in homoeopathy becomes crucial in order to verify the suitability of candidates for registration as homoeopaths. It is possible through an examination that evaluates the candidate's theoretical knowledge, clinical skills, and communication skills, among other relevant factors. TOR will become effective once the Council approves them. The TOR will act as guidelines that can be modified occasionally. Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan said it is a need of the time but, unfortunately, has not been implemented. He further suggested that training of the members may be arranged for this purpose. Homoeopathic Doctor Javed Akhtar seconded the viewpoint of Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan. Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem stated that a copy of TOR may be provided to the members for consideration. *"After detailed discussion, the chair resolved that a copy of TOR be provided to the members of NCH with a direction that output in this regard should be submitted in office within 15 days."*

Agenda Item No. 15: To discuss the long overdue compliance of section 35 (5) of UAHP, Act (II of 1965).

The chair stated that the said agenda item is not discussable, because it has already **OMITTED** from UAH Practitioners Act, (II of 1965).

Agenda Item No. 16: To discuss the letter regarding putting a stop to the ongoing college inspections.

The chair put up the next agenda item before the house for discussion, and he drew the house's attention to the fact that the present Council's tenure up to 15-11-2023 will remain fully functional with all affairs of the Council. *"Therefore, the chair decided that periodical inspections shall arrange of recognized institutions under section 18 (4) of the UAH Practitioners Act, 1965 till the expiry of the tenure".*

Agenda Item No. 17: To discuss the dissimilarity in eligibility criteria-KP-HCC's pool of eligible assessors.

The Chair put the next agenda item for discussion and invited Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak to brief the matter related to Healthcare Commission K.P. He briefed that HCC (K.P) advertisement was published on 19th April-2023. The main objective of the advertisement to establish a pool of trainers and assessors for various healthcare fields, including homoeopaths and tabibs. The eligibility criteria for Homoeopaths and Tabibs to apply as assessors and trainers were outlined in the advertisement. However, the Council members have expressed their reservations and believe that the homoeopath eligibility criteria are dissimilar/implausible and must be reviewed. He further read out the letter sent by NCH on 02nd May, 2023 to HCC (K.P) in response to above advertisement.

Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux, referring his letter to NCH in the context of the KP-HCC, argued that when determining the qualifications of trainers and assessors, there was a lack of

awareness about the potential suitability of highly educated and experienced DHMS practitioners, rather than the meager numbers of BHMS registered practitioners in KP. He suggested qualified, experienced practitioners amongst DHMS would be better suited as trainers and assessors besides the BHMS if available. During this conversation, the Homoeopathic Doctor. Ilahi Bux shared statistical information concerning the Registered BHMS practitioners in the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP). The authorized member also showed astonishment regarding the mishandling of the situation and asked to share the said statistical data.

Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem and Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan said that a copy of reply may be circulated amongst members for further guidance.

Decision:-

After discussion and ordering the members' viewpoints, the house authorized Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak to meet with higher authorities of the K.P Healthcare Commission to resolve this issue.

Agenda Item No. 18: To discuss the letter regarding missing components in the Recruiting process.

The above said point relates with agenda item No. 2 regarding minutes of Selection Committee meeting held on 17th July-2023 which has already been discussed..

Agenda Item No. 19: To discuss the letter regarding proceeding and decision of NCH, making public accessible.

The Secretary read the letter dated 1st June 2023 received from Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Buxin which the contents of the letter state:-

“that decisions entailed publishing the minutes of the Council’s meeting and circulars, letters and other related documents on the Council’s official website as required under section 5 & 6 of the **right of access to information Act, 2017**. These sections require the public disclosure of all significant discussions and outcomes about the official business conducted jointly since 2008”

Homoeopathic Doctor M.B. Jawed Awan stated that the Council has already decided that minutes of the meetings should be displayed on the Council’s website but have not been implemented so far. Homoeopathic Doctor Javed Akhtar said that an IT expert may be appointed for this purpose.

Decision:-

"After discussion, the house decided and directed the Secretary that minutes of the Council meetings since the present tenure, inclusively from the year 2008, shall be displayed on the official Website of NCH for public assessable under the compliance of the said Act."

Agenda Item No. 20: Modification in Numbering format of Agenda/Minutes of NCH.

The Secretary put the next agenda item for decision. He read the letter dated 21-10-2021 and its subsequent reminder dated 24-04-2023 received from Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux. He further stated that the existing numbering format needs modifications to make it self-indicative and locating. Therefore, a new format for the agenda may be adopted as follows:

- a) The first three digits will indicate the serial of the meeting.
- b) The second two digits will show the main serial of the item.
- c) The third two digits will be for sub serial of main serial.

For instance, the template may be as under:

"158.01.08" means this agenda point belongs to the 158th meeting, main agenda item No. is 01, and its sub item is 08th accordingly.

This new format will facilitate as follow:-

- 1) It is easy to locate the meeting serial merely by looking on agenda point.
- 2) It will pave the way for locating the placement of multiple references of agenda items on the timeline.
- 3) It will be easy to finalize relevant documents at the time of Audit.

Decision:-

The house unanimously approved the new template as mentioned above, i.e. (158.01.08), and further directed the Secretary to adopt all following agenda items of the meetings of the Councils.

Agenda Item No. 21: To discuss the request received from H/Dr. Hassan Ali for permission to carry out Research work regarding treatment of Hepatitis C in Homoeopathy on evidence and experimental.

The Secretary read the letter dated 10-07-2023 submitted by Homoeopathic Doctor Hassan Ali (Chief Organizer Punjab/K.P HOP). Homoeopathic Doctor Faial Saleem suggested that it is the domain of the Drug & Pharmacopeia Committee, and the above may be referred to the said Committee. Homoeopathic Doctor Naeem Hafeez seconded the viewpoint of Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem. After some discussion, *"the chair resolved and unanimously constituted a Committee comprising Homoeopathic Doctor Faisal Saleem, and Homoeopathic Doctor Aisha Nawaz and the Committee will submit the report in the Council's next meeting.."*

Agenda Item No. 22: To discuss the fate of the conditional Homoeopathic Medical Colleges in the light of inspection report of Charsadda HMC, Charsadda.

The Chair put the next agenda item concerning his involvement in the inspection team's visit Charsadda HMC in Charsadda, K.P. During the visit He observed that despite the Ministry of Health (Defunct) having recognized and officially notified numerous colleges several years ago, these institutions still maintained their conditional status.

According to Homeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux, those colleges are typically initially notified with conditions lasting one or two years. In numerous instances, over a decade has elapsed without any inquiry following the conditional period. In these cases, as no conditions persist, these colleges should be regarded as regular if they do not exhibit any significant deficiencies.

Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak suggested that a committee may be constituted to examine the notifications of the H.M. Colleges further.

Homoeopathic Doctor Mahmood-ul-Haq Abbasi said there is no provision in law regarding withdrawal of notification etc:-

Decision:-

The House has decided that colleges operating regularly despite having conditional status should be designated as "Recognized," while colleges that are deficient in light of inspection reports under the UAH Act (II of 1965) may be labeled as "Conditional," subject to their initial notified status.

Agenda Item No. 23: To discuss the qualification required for admission/enrolments in D.H.M.S after amendment in Section 21 (2) of UAH Practitioners Act, (II of 1965).

The said agenda item deferred for next meeting of the Council.

Agenda Item No. 24: To discuss the Finance Division office memorandum No. 9(7)R-I/2014-62/2023 dated: 14th February, 2023 regarding special dispensation for the Civil Servants in the Federal Government for the employees in BPS-1 to BPS-16.

The Secretary put up the next agenda item for discussion and decision. He read the letter issued by the Finance Division vide O.M No. 9 (7) R-I/2014-62/2023 dated 14th February 2023 before the house. At this juncture, Dr. Shahzad Khurshid, Chairman of the Finance Committee, NCH, briefed that the subject used in the aforementioned Office Memorandum of the Finance Division just for **Civil Servants** in the Federal Government but the servants of the Council are within the meaning of **Public Servant** in the light of Section 16 (5) of UAH Practitioners Act, (II of 1965).

Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak drew the attention of the Chairman Finance Committee towards Rule 3 (1) of NCH (Administration and Financial Management) Rules, 2008, which states:-

“The employees in each post shall be entitled to such pay and allowances and other fringe benefits as the Federal Government may sanction for its employees from time to time.

He further suggested to the chair that the said matter may be forwarded to the Finance Division for clarification.

Decision:-

After some discussion, the house decided and constituted a committee comprising Chairman Finance Committee, NCH, Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux and Registrar, NCH for finalization of the case in accordance with the relevant Rules and Regulations. The house further decided that decision of the committee should be a final decision.

MEMBERS POINTS

| NAME OF MEMBER | POINT | DISCUSSION | DECISION |
|---|--|---|---|
| Homoeopathic Doctor Waheed Ahmad Hijazi | 1)The easy paisa account of the Council. | The mover stated that easy paisa account of the Council may be opened to facilitate the colleges as well as applicants. Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux said it will be opened with the approval of the Ministry. | The Chair resolved as this time Chairman Finance Committee is not present in meeting. Therefore, it may be consulted with CFC, NCH. |
| | 2) The account of the | The members were of | The chair decided that |

| | | | |
|--|---|---|--|
| | Council in private Bank where facility of online deposit at free of cost. | the view that when the fee was transferred through NBP, the bank charged a heavy commission. They suggested that some private banks provide this facility for free online. | a list of private and scheduled banks may be collected that provides the facility of free online service to finalize the case. |
| | 3) The updated computerized program of the Council not implemented so far. | The Secretary stated that NCH software was assigned to the Digital Spot System last year, and the above is ready for installation. He further stated prior to its installation, the purchase of IT equipment (Hardware) is under negotiation and should be finalized shortly. | The chair decided that immediate steps may be taken for early installation of NCH software as it is an essential need, and a tender for computer purchasing may be floated urgently. |
| | 4) The performance of NCH examination branches needs improvement. | The mover said that no reply was received in response to forwarded letters. Enrolment cards have not been received for two years. Homoeopathic Doctor Saeed-ur-Rehman Khattak said that the R&I system needs to be corrected, and many cases of Registration and Renewals are often lost. | The Chair decided and directed the Controller of Examinations to look into all these issues/complaints personally, and a compliance report may be provided to the office shortly. |
| | 5) The poor performance of LCS Courier Service during the D.H.M.S Annual Examination, 2023. | The mover drew attention to the house that during the conduction of the DHMS Annual Examination 2023, very poor services were provided by LCS, and question papers were not delivered in time at Nusrat HMC, Quetta. Sometimes, question | The Chair decided that in the future, question papers may get delivered through other renowned couriers and directed to the Controller of Examinations so that necessary steps may be taken. The chair further resolved that a |

| | | | |
|---|---|---|--|
| | | papers were not received despite several phone calls to said courier.. | letter may be forwarded to the LCS on account of poor performance observed by the members of NCH. |
| Homoeopathic Doctor Siddique Ali Ansari | 1) The Present position of NCH Karachi Building. | The mover stated that being a member from Sindh province, I am unaware of the present position of the NCH Karachi Building. At this stage, Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux(Member concerned of the Committee) briefed that office has already forwarded a letter on 03-05-2023 to Mr. Muhammad Younus Billoo regarding determining the rent of the occupied area of the premises. In response, the reply has been received on 11-05-2023. Homoeopathic Doctor Ilahi Bux read the said letter's contents for decision. | The chair decided that the Committee would finalize the matter in accordance with law as already constituted for this purpose by the Council. |
| | 2) To change the printing of Registration/Card of Homoeopathic Practitioners. | ----- | The chair resolved that the matter regarding the printing of Registration, Renewals, and other Certificates is in progress with National Security Printing Company (Pvt) Limited, Karachi, and it should be finalized on the installation of NCH software. |
| | 3) The present condition of NCH | ----- | The chair decided that necessary measures/steps for the |

| | | | |
|--|---|--|---|
| | Regional office, Karachi. | | condition of the Building will be taken up after finalization of the case in the light of the NCH letter issued on 03-05-2023. |
| | 4) The renovation/condition of NCH Building at Islamabad. | a) During the discussion, Homoeopathic Doctor Naeem Hafeez said that the condition of the NCH Building is very miserable, and it should need partitions and paint, etc: b) Homoeopathic Doctor Javed Akhtar said this point has been discussed many times in Council meetings but not implemented. The Secretary briefed that recent renovation work like maintenance of the Building's roof, basement cleanliness and, electricity maintenance, was done.. The work of paint would be in due course. | The chair appreciated the work already completed in office and further directed to the Secretary to complete the remaining work as early as possible. |

CONCLUSION:

At 4: 30 pm, the meeting ended with a vote of thanks by the Chair.

Copy to:-

All concerned.

(Signature)
(Aamir Nadeem Ramay)
Registrar, NCH